



Developing Car Clubs in Scotland

A Review by the Transform Scotland Trust

June 2010





Report prepared for:

Transform Scotland Trust

5 Rose Street, Edinburgh, Scotland EH2 2PR

t: 0131 243 2690

e: trust@transformscotland.org.uk

w: www.transformscotland.org.uk

Report prepared by: Chas Ball

Chas Ball is an associate of Richard Armitage Transport Consultancy Ltd. RATC assisted with the consultations and in the production of this report. www.ratransport.co.uk

© Copyright 2010 Transform Scotland Trust and the Author

Contents

Foreword	4
Executive Summary	5
A Review of Car Clubs in Scotland	
1 About the review	7
2. Growth of car clubs in Britain	9
3. Barriers to car club development	11
4. Improvements in technology	12
5 Support for car clubs in Scottish cities	13
6. Car clubs in rural Scotland	14
7. Co-operatives and car clubs	15
8. Contribution to government policy objectives	17
9. Low carbon vehicles	19
10. Conclusions	20
Urban car clubs	20
Small town and rural car club schemes	21
11. Recommendations	22
12. Budget	24
13. Delivery of the Car Club Support Programme	26
Option 1 - Regional Transport Partnerships	26
Option 2 - Carplus Trust	26
Option 3 - A national NGO	26
Appendix 1: Summary of Workshop Responses	27
1. Key points from the consultations	27
2. Barriers to car club development	28
3. Opportunities for Car Club development	30
4. A support programme for Car Clubs	33
Appendix 2: Roundtable Consultation	38
1. Rural workshop 1	38
2. Urban Workshop 1	39
Appendix 3: Workshop Conclusions	40
1 Regional Workshop Format	40
2 Workshop 1: Glasgow 02.11.09	40
3 Workshop 2 Inverness 03.11.09	42
4 Workshop 3 Perth 08.11.09	43
5 Workshop 4 Linlithgow 03.12.09	45
Appendix 4: References	46
Glossary	47

Foreword

Scotland - like many other countries around the world - is grappling with the challenges arising from the travel choices we make. Delivering effective sustainable transport outcomes requires effective planning and adequate resourcing, including a budget commensurate with the scale of the task.

Smarter Choices are an inexpensive and effective set of measures encouraging and helping organisations and individuals to choose more sustainable forms of travel as they go about their quotidian round. Examples include: workplace travel plans, school travel plans, personalised travel plans, public transport information, travel awareness campaigns, car clubs, car sharing schemes, teleworking, teleconferencing and home shopping. Small changes can cumulate and make large differences to carbon footprints.



Recent Transform Scotland Trust reports have looked at the substantial savings that could be made to the Scottish economy by encouraging more active travel - cycling and walking - (*Towards a Healthier Economy: Transform Scotland Trust, 2009*) and at European best practice in providing political will for improved infrastructure (*Civilising the Streets: Transform Scotland Trust, 2010*).

This thorough and timely Report looks at car clubs in Scotland and makes recommendations for their maintenance and growth. The Edinburgh car club project was initially funded in 1997 by the UK Government, Scottish Executive and The City of Edinburgh Council and it is now the largest city scheme in Britain outside London. This report tracks the growth of both urban and rural car club schemes and identifies the modest budget and the local, regional and national support needed for the further development of car clubs in Scotland.

Stephen Stradling.

Chair of Trustees, the Transform Scotland Trust and Professor Emeritus, Transport Research Institute, Edinburgh Napier University

Executive Summary

1 Introduction

- 1.1 Car clubs allow people the flexibility of using a car without the cost and responsibility of owning one. Through a mix of joining fees and annual or monthly charges, car club members pay for use of a vehicle on an hourly or daily tariff that also includes an allowance for distance travelled. The car club operator, rather than the member, pays for running costs (i.e. vehicle excise duty, insurance and vehicle maintenance) as well as fuel costs (which are reflected in the mileage charges).
- 1.2 Starting in Edinburgh, car clubs have been established for a decade in Britain as a commercial service. But it was only recently that they have been widely recognised as a potential contributor to sustainable transport policy objectives. A few far-sighted local authorities have now taken the lead and supported car clubs using a mix of third party and developer contributions.
- 1.3 Since 2009, car clubs have been accorded higher recognition by the Scottish Government due to their potential to make cost effective reductions in carbon emissions as evidenced by the government-commissioned Atkins/University of Aberdeen report *Mitigating Transport's Climate Change Impact in Scotland: Assessment of Policy Options*.¹
- 1.4 As worldwide fossil fuel shortages arise and energy costs increase, cost-conscious people will be discouraged from using sole occupancy cars. Not only will this raise the demand for public transport, but increase the use of other modes (such as walking and cycling) and popularise travel reduction through other Smarter Choices measures (such as conferencing and the use of car clubs and car sharing).
- 1.5 As well as their potential for reducing carbon emissions, car clubs can also provide economic benefit. Research for Transport for London, supported by evidence from a community-based car club in the north of Scotland, shows that members of car clubs can on average save between £1,000 and £3,500 per year.²
- 1.6 Following a conference in March 2009 co-hosted by The City of Edinburgh Council and the Transform Scotland Trust, the Trust commissioned a review of the opportunities for car club development in Scotland. The review was tasked with identifying what barriers existed for the roll-out of car clubs in both urban and rural Scotland, and what framework was required to effectively promote their implementation.
- 1.7 The review explored the potential for car clubs to meet climate change emission reductions as well as other social, economic, planning and environmental government policy objectives. The review concluded by examining the potential of car clubs to expand the co-operative sector in Scotland.

¹ Atkins/University of Aberdeen *Mitigating Transport's Climate Change Impact in Scotland: Assessment of Policy Options* (Scottish Government, 2009). Available at <http://openscotland.net/Publications/2009/08/26141950/0>

² Transport for London's research, *Attitudes towards Car Clubs* (Synovate, April 2007). Evidence from Park Carpool, Findhorn <http://www.transformscotland.org.uk/carclubsreview.aspx>.

2 Key Findings

- 2.1 The essential prerequisites for expanding car club membership in Scotland to at least 100,000 members by 2022 are first the creation of the parking infrastructure and secondly addressing the need for changes in attitudes in our “car culture”.
- 2.2 There is genuine potential for an enlarged car club sector in urban Scotland, building on the ten years of experience in Edinburgh, whilst drawing on lessons from London and continental European cities. However, car clubs are not easy enterprises to establish and their viability depends on building up, relatively quickly, a critical mass of membership close to the car locations. Although commercial car clubs do appear to be able to fund their own growth, the longer they take to achieve this critical mass, the more start-up funding they require.
- 2.3 Despite some encouraging examples from England, less clear is the potential for car clubs in smaller towns and rural communities. However, given a supportive infrastructure, the establishment of a range of demonstration projects, and an increasing level of public awareness derived from their growth in major cities, a viable car club network could be established in some of Scotland’s smaller population centres. This would help meet mobility needs in rural areas and contribute to the resilience of local communities in smaller towns and rural villages and islands. The Atkins/University of Aberdeen report proposed that to achieve an effective national presence for car clubs, development should be targeted to market towns and urban settlements of over 25,000 people.³
- 2.4 The review shows there is a sound case for public funding of the *initial* period of growth of car clubs. This resource should be used to promote good working partnerships between car club operators and local authorities. From the experience at The City of Edinburgh Council, and in a number of English cities, an important factor in building an effective relationship is when the public sector partner becomes a corporate member. If this can occur at the outset, it helps establish the viability and scale of the scheme and provides leadership to other public bodies in the city or town.⁴
- 2.5 As car clubs achieve wider recognition, efforts should be made to ensure they are more effectively integrated into urban design and with other transport modes, and seen as another form of ‘public transport’. This would mean more effective use of planning guidance to ensure opportunities for integration of car club use at an early stage in the development of higher density housing, urban employment centres and transport hubs.
- 2.6 In helping to reduce the carbon emissions from transport, car clubs could also contribute in other ways. The review found that it is likely car clubs will play a role in the expansion of electric vehicles and plug-in hybrids. They could also be an integral part of promoting the wider use of Ultra Low Emission Vehicles (ULEVs). Car club members would be more amenable to trialling this form of vehicle.

3 Key Recommendations

- 3.1 The recommendation of the review is for a co-ordinated public support programme over a minimum period of four years involving the Scottish Government, Local Authorities and the Regional Transport Partnerships to the value of £1.825m. Such a programme would help to accelerate development in the main conurbations. It would consist of part funding for 400

³ The report assumes that the network of car clubs be rolled out over a 10 year period so that there is one in every main town (over 25k population) in Scotland by 2022 in the Ambitious Scenario or 2027 in the Central Scenario.

⁴ See the case study on the Edinburgh City Car Club available on the Sustainable Development Commission website at http://www.sd-commission.org.uk/communitiesummit/show_case_study.php/00085.html.

parking bays, technical support, and assistance with tackling public awareness through social marketing and public information. Although the process of consultation and obtaining traffic orders (TROs) could be streamlined, the effective delivery of this initial batch of 400 dedicated parking bays provides the key building block to achieving over 20,000 members by 2015.

The programme would have three outcomes:

- (i) It would ensure that urban car club operations become financially viable more quickly and allow some developer contributions to be sought now for later years;
- (ii) It would encourage take up of pool cars by employers, which may also fit well with promoting greater use of ultra low carbon vehicles; and
- (iii) It would stimulate awareness and interest in smaller towns.

- 3.2 The local authority contribution, parking infrastructure and public awareness-raising would encourage car club operators to invest in the schemes. Regional Transport Partnerships' involvement would help to create links between adjacent authorities covered by the car club when fully developed. The proposed programme would accelerate the development and help to grow the market for car clubs, at the same time monitoring its effectiveness.
- 3.3 In parallel, rural car club operations in areas where it is possible to demonstrate community support could apply for assistance to develop their own car clubs. In smaller towns and rural areas, the objectives over 2011-2015 would be to support the development of between 6 and 10 demonstration schemes. These individual schemes would be encouraged to work together in order to share access to or the purchase of the ICT systems, insurance and back office support.
- 3.4 Although the proposed programme would not finance the full costs of the development of rural car clubs, effective support in early development would make long-term viability much more likely. Through the provision of practical support and funding for systems and initial vehicles, it is envisaged that community operators will generate sufficient revenue and seek other sources of grant and loans, in order to become self-sustaining after three years.
- 3.5 The programme would also develop a national, centralised approach for operator accreditation, scheme monitoring, and the development of an information and awareness-raising programme. Such a co-ordinated support programme would also allow collaboration on funding bids. Car club development guidance would be available for local authorities, community organisations and co-operatives.
- 3.6 If the programme is effectively implemented we believe the car club sector will grow steadily from its present level of 3,000 members to approximately 25,000 members with over 650 cars by 2014/15. This is based on a range of factors including the favourable characteristics of the two main cities - Edinburgh and Glasgow - in respect of urban density, good public transport, levels of car ownership and social demographics. The potential in these cities is to grow in a way that has some parallels with growth in London, where membership now exceeds 85,000.
- 3.7 A slower take-up is likely in Aberdeen and Dundee, which will start later and will need to establish support with employers and suitable higher density residential areas in which to launch the schemes. Given some central support with infrastructure, these schemes will benefit from rising public awareness that will transfer from the existence of larger schemes in the central belt.
- 3.8 Volatile fuel prices will act as a catalyst to behaviour change and government-backed incentives to reduce transport carbon emissions should contribute to the creation of the projected growth in membership. Based on achieving the projected level of growth of about 25,000 members by 2015, we consider it is feasible for 110,000 households to be using car clubs by 2022.

A review of Car Clubs in Scotland

1 About the review

- 1.1 The review was tasked with identifying what barriers exist for the roll-out of car clubs in both urban and rural Scotland, and what framework is required to effectively promote their implementation. It comprised both a literature review and a consultative process involving stakeholders in order to ascertain what would be needed to establish a supportive policy framework and an effective mechanism to deliver that support.
- 1.2 The review was supported by four of Scotland's seven regional transport partnerships (TACTRAN, SESTRAN, SPT and HITRANS), Co-operative Development Scotland, First ScotRail and the Scottish Government.
- 1.3 The consultative process was carried out via workshops or interview (face-to-face or via telephone and email) and received input from a wide range of people including local authority officers (transport, parking, environmental health and fleet management) and councillors, transport consultants, academics, NGOs, NHS managers, community organisations, developers, planners and car club operators. Amongst other things, submissions addressed issues such as how car clubs contribute to key policy objectives, the barriers to their expansion beyond Edinburgh, and what car clubs will need in order for them to flourish.
- 1.4 Five regional consultation workshops were held, including one specifically on car clubs and co-operatives:
- | | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| <i>Monday 2nd November 2009</i> | <i>Glasgow (Car clubs consultation)</i> |
| <i>Tuesday 3rd November 2009</i> | <i>Inverness (Car clubs consultation)</i> |
| <i>Monday 9th November 2009</i> | <i>Perth (Car clubs consultation)</i> |
| <i>Wednesday 2nd December 2009</i> | <i>Glasgow (Car clubs and co-operatives meeting)</i> |
| <i>Thursday 3rd December 2009</i> | <i>Linlithgow (Car clubs consultation)</i> |
- 1.5 At the consultation workshops a number of presentations were made which examined lessons learnt from existing car clubs including those in urban Edinburgh, rural South Devon and a neighbourhood scheme in Findhorn. Background data and analysis regarding the growth of car clubs in Britain was provided to workshop participants prior to seeking their views on the key issues of the review.⁵ Participants in the workshops looked at how far access to a car club car is convenient and affordable and provides a real alternative to private car ownership.
- 1.6 The findings and draft conclusions of the review were then discussed at a roundtable event hosted by the Scottish Government at Victoria Quay, Leith, on 15 January 2010. This event considered the draft recommendations and provided a commentary on the options proposed. The roundtable considered the most effective ways of implementing a car clubs support programme involving the Scottish Government, Regional Transport Partnerships, Local Authorities, and NGOs.
- 1.7 This report outlines the results of these consultations, summarising feedback from participants in examining both urban and rural potential for the development of car clubs in Scotland.⁶ It also draws from experience in both the UK and Europe to provide guidance on how car clubs could effectively be promoted in Scotland and what intervention is required by the relevant key stakeholders at all levels of government, the public, private and voluntary sectors.

⁵ Presentations can be viewed at <http://www.transformscotland.org.uk/carclubsreview.aspx>.

⁶ A comprehensive report of individual workshop participation is available at Appendix 1.

2. Growth of car clubs in Britain

- 2.1 When the UK car club sector passed 100,000 members in November 2009 the then Secretary of State for Transport, Lord Adonis, took the opportunity to appear on television to express the UK Government's commitment to car clubs.
- 2.2 Starting in Edinburgh, car clubs have been established for a decade in Britain as a commercial service. But it was only recently that they have been widely recognised as a potential contributor to sustainable transport policy objectives. A few far-sighted local authorities have taken the lead and supported car clubs using a mix of third party and developer contributions, European funding (Civitas or Interreg programmes), and UK government transport planning funds.⁷
- 2.3 According to a study undertaken on behalf of Zipcar by the Economist Intelligence Unit, the key characteristics in assessing the world's major cities for developing car clubs are: population, density, levels of education, standards of public transport, state of economy and cost of parking.⁸ According to the study, cities such as London, with high population density, extensive public transit systems and a relatively high burden of car ownership have the highest potential for car clubs. Cities with less expensive parking, lower education attainment levels and higher vehicle ownership rates offer a less conducive business environment for car clubs.
- 2.4 In the UK today, four private companies - Streetcar, City Car Club, Zipcar and Connect by Hertz - occupy a large section of the market.⁹ Development has been concentrated in London and a few other large cities. Carplus estimates that the growth of car club membership in Britain will reach approximately 450,000 members by 2014-15.¹⁰ This projection assumes continued expansion in London, complemented by growth in the sector across Britain, concentrated in about 20 major cities and towns including several in Scotland and Wales. Based on these projections, car club growth in Scotland - with no other intervention or support - could at best be about 13,000 members by 2014-15 with a fleet of around 350 cars.
- 2.5 In the UK, only London has an effective support programme, run by Transport for London (TfL), with resources largely channelled through 20 of the 33 participating boroughs. The funding provided through TfL in 2009/10 and 2010/11 amounts to £1 million. This city region has the most favourable conditions for car clubs and at the time of writing accounts for over 80% of the sector's presence in Britain.¹¹
- 2.6 The Transport for London support programme for car clubs provides a useful insight into how a large city can intervene to contribute to the growth of car clubs whilst ensuring good quality services and operational data. The programme contributes to:
- (i) Pre-consultation with residents;
 - (ii) Introducing car club vehicles, whilst simultaneously reducing parking for residents, with street space returned to amenity use;

⁷ Section 75 of the Town & Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 provides planning authorities with the power to secure commitment from developers for the provision of on-street and off-street parking for car clubs, as well as subsidy of vehicles during the development's construction and occupation, and payment of initial joining fees for tenants and purchasers. In return the developer can secure permission for lower ratios of parking spaces to dwellings.

⁸ Zipcar news release (3rd June 2009) 'Zipcar Announces First Comprehensive Global Car-Sharing Study'. Available at www.zipcar.com.

⁹ In April 2010, US-owned Zipcar announced the purchase of Streetcar, to form Zipcar UK. This will reduce the number of commercial operators from 4 to 3 during 2010. See <http://www.carplus.org.uk/wordpress/zipcar-and-streetcar-join-forces>

¹⁰ Carplus (November 2009) briefing paper for DfT Secretary of State. Unpublished.

¹¹ Carplus news release (March 2009) www.carplus.org.uk

- (iii) On-street information and signing;
 - (iv) Understanding and reporting on car club expansion, impacts and good practice;
 - (v) Electric or hybrid plug-in car trials at selected on-street locations.
- 2.7 For three years, the TfL programme has progressively involved nearly two-thirds of London's 33 councils. Over 400 new on-street bays have been introduced with a further 100 in the approved plans. In 2008-09, seven councils introduced car club vehicles for the first time.
- 2.8 Core activities included supporting the operator accreditation programme, collecting membership data, an annual membership survey and an operator evaluation exercise. TfL also contributed funding for a national website with a searchable map. This is updated regularly to show the latest car locations and Carplus operates a related central enquiry service. The quarterly forum for borough officers and car club operators has allowed for the sharing of experience, the discussion of common issues and promotion of good practice.
- 2.9 TfL also supported a regional promotional programme, including a pilot advertising campaign launched in the London Boroughs of Richmond-upon-Thames and Brent. The campaign objectives were to:
- (i) Increase public awareness of the concept of car clubs
 - (ii) Increase the membership of car clubs
 - (iii) Evaluation new promotional practices for possible rollout of activity across all London boroughs.
- 2.10 The key message was that car clubs offer a cost saving of up to £3,500 per year for a household compared to owning a car and the campaign was judged on the following KPIs:
- (i) Awareness of the advertising campaign
 - (ii) Awareness and understanding of what a car club is
 - (iii) Web visits
 - (iv) Press coverage
 - (v) Increase in car club membership.
- 2.11 A number of specific initiatives were trialled out in 2008/09:
- (i) Support for multiple vehicle car club bays
 - (ii) Social inclusion through car club bays located in social housing areas
 - (iii) Car clubs and transport interchanges
 - (iv) Retail sites and provision of bike stands at new car club bays.
- 2.12 The project will be used to inform TfL whether this local authority led approach, coupled with generic regional marketing, offers value for money, or whether some or all of these activities are best left to the private sector (i.e. car club operators). This is important as it offers a possible model of public sector support in Scotland.
- 2.13 Research by Imperial College London is currently being undertaken regarding car clubs' market potential and how they impact on travel behaviour. In two boroughs, where car clubs are busiest, the 'limits to growth' has been analysed by consultants,¹² which concluded that it would be possible to expand membership in Camden and Islington boroughs to over 100,000.

¹² Clark, Matthew Steer Davies Gleave - Camden & Islington Car Club Market Study (presentation Carplus Conference, March 2010)

3. Barriers to car club development

- 3.1 From the earliest schemes – Edinburgh (1999) and Bristol (2000) – it has taken a decade for car clubs to gain acceptance as part of providing mobility, complementing public transport, taxis, cycling and walking.
- 3.2 As in Switzerland and then Germany, car clubs initially experienced slow growth. As outlined in section 2.3, there are a number of factors which can influence the level of take-up and utilisation. Until car clubs are established on a larger scale, it is difficult to demonstrate their viability. How long this takes depends considerably on the state of the market place and level of promotion. However other factors can also come into play. For example, in Brussels, the most important factor in accelerating growth was parking management changes that made residential parking less available. Depending upon external conditions, a scheme can take from three to more than five years to achieve self-sustaining status.
- 3.3 Car club operators and champions have had to promote the benefits of a strong car club sector, whilst simultaneously selecting the best areas to operate in order to achieve profitability. This has been an essential prerequisite to attracting private investor finance. The distinct absence of support for measures to facilitate and encourage “car-sharing” clubs (as they are called in mainland Europe) has been a brake on development as it has meant operators and individual local authorities, sometime with EU support, have had to fund all the innovation and development activity.
- 3.4 Even for community and not-for-profit schemes, the ability to move to a financially viable operation has been a concern of community investors, foundations and grant-making bodies. They have accepted that for an initial period a scheme may need pump-priming funds, but are understandably reluctant to accept a scheme that needs a permanent subsidy.
- 3.5 After analysis of the barriers - both physical and cultural - the support programme agreed by TfL was carefully targeted to help boroughs and operators overcome these barriers. Its aim was to help make car clubs accessible over a wider area, through a larger number of local authorities, reducing the risks of schemes being launched or expanded without effective planning and technical support.
- 3.6 The TfL programme was designed to overcome barriers that had been experienced from 2002 when car club activities started in London. The key elements are:
- (i) Effective introduction and expansion of parking infrastructure
 - (ii) Technical assistance to officers, particularly dealing with introduction of new schemes
 - (iii) Public awareness initiatives involving branding, generic marketing and experimental campaigns
 - (iv) Support for localised trials (run by one or two boroughs only) to test new concepts, such as extending car clubs into areas of social housing and high visibility marketing campaigns.

4. Improvements in technology

4.1 Car club operations are continuously improving. Over the past few years, services have become more reliable, convenient and flexible, using advances in mobile telephony and in-car computer systems. Bespoke information and communication technologies have been tailored for the car club market and as this has grown worldwide, the technology has dropped in price whilst reliability has improved. This in turn has reduced operators' costs and improved service to members. For smaller operators, there will continue to be entry barriers to making use of some of the technology, which we discuss below.

4.2 Many more car club members today own a mobile phone and have access at home or work to the internet than did so in 1999 when the Edinburgh scheme started. The growth of access to these technologies has made it possible to assume a higher proportion of car club members will book cars in advance on the internet and be able to use a mobile phone to call in to the help desk or control centre with any queries or problems they have whilst attempting to use the service.

4.3 The experience of Moorcar, the Devon-based car club co-op¹³, is that technology applications can only be adopted by independent operators as finances and revenues permit a step change. The challenge is to generate enough additional business to fund the extra outgoings that arise from fitting and running the on-board telematics. Until this happens, there are low-tech options available.

The basic IT needs, according to Moorcar, are an internet-based booking system and phone support:

- Internet booking is an essential requirement, and it must be reliable, 365 days a year, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week
- It should offer independent self-confirming bookings
- It should be simple to use and self-explanatory
- Telephone support should be available to members at all reasonable hours (plus, "a local fixer" - i.e. a person available to attend to members' problems).

4.4 Further ICT enhancements will be implemented in the next decade that will enable operators to help present the car as a mobility service. Some of these changes will propel the car club concept to the fore, as will manufacturer's and government programmes to promote wider use of electric cars and plug-in hybrids on a shared or pooled basis.

¹³ See <http://www.moorcar.co.uk>

5 Support for car clubs in Scottish cities

- 5.1 In Scotland, Edinburgh was designated as a flagship car club scheme in 1999 (since 2001 it has been operated by City Car Club.¹⁴) It was supported by the Scottish Government and the Department for Transport. They assisted The City of Edinburgh Council to prepare for and launch what is now Britain's best developed car club scheme outside London - with approximately 3,000 members and 90 cars. The scheme, which was aimed at reducing traffic congestion and relieving parking pressure, was conceived in 1996 and used the experience of car clubs in Germany and Switzerland as its inspiration.
- 5.2 A conference held by the City of Edinburgh Council and the Transform Scotland Trust in March 2009 explored the lessons of Edinburgh's experience of car club development including recent evaluations of the business use by council staff. Until this event, there had been little notice taken of the lessons from this project for other UK cities.¹⁵ The conference helped to awaken interest during 2009 - particularly in other Scottish cities - and to secure greater recognition for this element of the City's sustainable transport strategy.
- 5.3 In Edinburgh, the largest cost has been the parking infrastructure (including Traffic Orders, lining and signing), and this has been part-funded by Section 75 contributions (see footnote 7). The infrastructure and awareness-raising costs have proved to be a minor part of the City's expenditure on transport. Only £6,000 per annum was spent on marketing from 2004 and 2007. In practice, in 2009/10 the expenditure on promotion and on new parking bays was nil, although the operator is hoping for a limited expansion of parking infrastructure in 2010/11.
- 5.4 In 2010/11, the first phase of the development of car clubs is expected in Glasgow and Aberdeen. This will be through work currently being undertaken by the local authorities as part of the development of Low Emission Zones. Initially, this will necessitate the award of a contract to a car club operator to work in partnership with each local authority, which in turn will undertake the first phase of the necessary parking infrastructure. The operator selected will be expected to grow the local market with employers, SMEs, developers and residents. Parking locations will concentrate first in higher density areas with good public transport, cycling and walking links to the city centre and to areas of employment and education. In addition, guidance from operators and write-in campaigns by residents have also been used to identify areas with good prospects.
- 5.6 After the establishment of the first dedicated parking bays, resources will be needed to expand the car club infrastructure and promote the concept beyond the initial areas - those most favourable for launching a new concept.
- 5.7 In the second phase more parking bays will be needed in areas adjacent to the area where the car club has started working. The second phase should also aim to include areas of social housing in socially mixed high density areas.
- 5.8 The choice of suitable locations will be a critical factor in the early years of the project as the operator seeks to ensure that it becomes self-financing as quickly as possible. There are areas close to the city centres where car ownership is made more difficult by parking pressures.
- 5.9 For the car club operator, it will be difficult to justify investment unless the level of population density and demographic characteristics demonstrate the scheme can reach a size of approximately 30 cars after two years with a reasonable level of utilisation. To achieve a viable level of utilisation (i.e. at least five chargeable hours per day per car), a mixture of users will be required including employees and residents. Initially the target will be for the local operation to meet its direct costs in terms of vehicle leasing, costs of local support operations, direct costs of local staff and marketing spend.

¹⁴ The company was originally called Smart Moves Ltd.

¹⁵ Pratt, Kimberley (2009) *The Process of Knowledge Transfer from Researcher and Policy Maker to End-User: With reference to two case studies: REAP and the Edinburgh Car Club*. Published as part of the ISSUES (Implementation Strategies for Sustainable Urban Environment Systems) project.

6. Car clubs in rural Scotland

- 6.1 Several rural communities have been assisted by the Scottish Government's Climate Challenge Fund (CCF) to undertake feasibility studies for the implementation of a car club. Subject to raising the start up funding, one or two may be established in 2010 or 2011 in Scotland.
- 6.2 Some of these communities have concluded that, without a support programme, the task of getting started was too much for local volunteers. Equally, there is recognition that the process of investigating what would be involved in a successful car club initiative can also help to demonstrate that local conditions are not suitable.
- 6.3 Although difficult to establish, there are good examples of small successful car clubs in small market towns in England. There may also be new opportunities in the next few years as the car club market develops. For example, the core of a new scheme could be a contract for the car club operator to provide vehicles for public sector staff business travel, thereby underpinning the community part of the scheme.
- 6.4 Several elements have become clear from the few existing successful "rural" schemes in English market towns. These are mostly operated by community (i.e. members') co-operatives or a community enterprise and have been kick-started by a support programme. The most well established schemes were initially funded by the Countryside Agency (2002-05) which assisted with initial capital costs and some of the early revenue expenditure.¹⁶
- 6.5 Schemes have been established in areas with a sense of community and where population density ensures that cars located within 400m of homes and workplaces achieve adequate use. These have included Hebden Bridge and Bentham in Yorkshire and Stroud in the South West.
- 6.6 Such independent car clubs need community "champions". Their first task is to undertake or commission a feasibility study to establish the market conditions.
- 6.7 The greatest challenge however is adopting a workable implementation plan. The voluntary group promoting a scheme will need to research membership contracts, insurance, a web booking system and linked billing software. It may require at some point to install a telematics suite using a small on-board computer linked to a vehicle access system. Some assistance will be available from existing schemes and from Carplus Trust but proper evaluation of the best options will not often be possible by a small community organisation.
- 6.8 There are several suppliers with a range of ICT services suitable for car club operations. It would be advantageous to select the most cost effective and reliable package that can serve a number of independent car clubs in Scotland. If groups can be encouraged to source services together, there are economies of scale. By encouraging communities embarking on this process to work together, perhaps through a secondary co-operative, it would be possible to establish a limited number of preferred suppliers who, by supplying services to a number of schemes, could establish a more effective infrastructure. Considerable benefit would accrue if effective dispassionate guidance on procurement is available and is controlled by the end users.
- 6.9 Whilst administering a car club with paper-based journey records and a key safe is acceptable in a community scheme, the adoption of a telematics programme will make independent car clubs more attractive to corporate users and should be an option for future development. During the review's regional workshops, the potential for local authority and SNH staff to make use of pooled cars or car club cars on islands, allowing them to leave cars at the mainland terminal, was identified.
- 6.10 The adoption of an on-board system that will permit remote access to suitably equipped vehicles with a smart card, mobile phone or zapper is an attractive option. This technology is increasingly becoming more affordable and, provided there is an adequate GSM mobile phone signal, it will be accessible in remoter areas.
- 6.11 Champions of this approach may also need assistance with legal structures suitable for operating a community or co-operative business.

¹⁶ Countryside Agency (2004): Rural Car Clubs.

7. Co-operatives and car clubs

- 7.1 The independent car club sector, which includes consumer co-operatives and community interest companies, uses a different business model to commercial operators. Although it faces some difficult challenges, it has made progress in a few locations in England. The majority, although not all, are a legacy of the Countryside Agency support programme which commenced in 2002 funding the feasibility studies, and in some cases the set up, of 12 schemes in the South West and Yorkshire regions.
- 7.2 For a small-scale operator wanting to develop a car club in a market town there are added problems. Achieving viability with a car club business depends on getting active members and operating several cars successfully. Where locations lack the critical mass of people or settlement density there may not be enough users living or working close to the “car stations”. The ratio of members to cars in a mature scheme is approximately 40:1, with at least half of members being occasional users. In an independent rural/market town scheme the ratio needs to be closer to 15:1.
- 7.3 The scale of operation possible in a rural area - even if a scheme covers a series of market towns - means the number of income generating units that contribute to central overheads will always be small. As a result, independent schemes depend on keeping their overheads low. For instance, many use web-based services bought in from elsewhere, sometimes in other countries. These make a charge per booking or per car to use their booking and billing systems, and this can be more cost effective than developing an in-house alternative.
- 7.4 To operate successfully as a business in a small town or rural community it is clear from the experience of independent car clubs in England that new rural car clubs in Scotland would need financial support and access to technical advice in the setting up phase. From analysis based on contemporary examples, it is suggested that a start-up would need up to £15,000 for feasibility studies and business planning. A further £25,000 for initial start-up would fund the acquisition of two to three cars and the installation of appropriate booking and billing systems. However, this could be reduced with central procurement arrangements that assist new schemes by providing a lower entry cost threshold (see section 11 Table A: Scottish Car Club Support Programme).
- 7.5 In Europe and North America, there are several successful smaller car clubs which are operated as mutuals. Existing models of large scale co-operatively-owned car clubs in Canada provide an example of enterprises in major cities such as Vancouver and Montreal. Historically, co-ops in Canada have benefited from a supportive financial environment where co-ops and credit unions have an established role in the economy.
- 7.6 Car clubs need to be capable of raising funds for expansion, vehicle fleet renewal and investment in software and hardware. Moving into profitability may take some time, so co-operative and community enterprises would need to raise funds from grants and foundations to establish the core infrastructure and fleet and build up a customer base.
- 7.7 Community shops and community energy projects have raised funds from local investors wishing to support community development through the ‘community co-operative’ model. Co-operatives established with the support of community investors have a long history in rural Scotland.

- 7.8 Historically, the adoption of community co-ops to encourage community investment and community development on remote rural Scottish communities can be traced back to 1978. This was enabled by the Highland and Islands Development Board (now HIE) which initially launched the multifunctional rural community co-ops programme in the Western Isles. By late 1979 this was extended to the rest of the board's area.
- 7.9 Some of these community co-ops are still going, perhaps due to factors such as their remoteness, a strong sense of community, support from HIE and the local authority. In some cases the community co-operatives chose to run essential community services. Latterly, community shops, pubs and community energy schemes have adopted similar structures and are part of the foundation of some communities. Community co-operatives and community investment have recently received a new boost as a result of recent reforms.¹⁷
- 7.10 The challenge of car club development outside the major conurbations in Scotland raises important questions about how the mutual option can work effectively in smaller towns and rural areas. Where private operators are unable to provide services, a community-run operation may be viable through the establishment of a co-operative with car club users and local well-wishers as co-operative members.
- 7.11 As part of this review, a “Co-operatives and car clubs” workshop was held in Glasgow. It examined how far car club development in Scotland could take the mutual route and considered the ability of co-operative enterprises to compete alongside commercial operators. New legal frameworks, such as the Community Interest Company, perhaps combined with a co-operative structure, could provide access to a mix of community investment, public support and support from mutual lenders.
- 7.12 The Plunkett Foundation and Cooperatives UK are supporting this trend towards mutuality and community investment as it provides a renewal of co-operative principles. For a rural community it can also add to its resilience. Ideally the local committee should not be expected to take on too much responsibility without practical and technical support given that this will initially be quite a fragile project. Its ability to succeed will depend on the good decisions being taken in the first two years.
- 7.13 The establishment of guidance in establishing a local enterprise on co-operative lines would be important. Securing resources to access development support from Co-operative Development Scotland and their business advisers needs to be part of any support programme. In addition new co-operatively owned car clubs could potentially benefit from marketing support from other co-operatives including the consumer co-operative sector.
- 7.14 There is an alternative route for an independent car club that is not based on co-operative rules. One established community enterprise using Community Interest Company (CIC) rules is now quite well established. Commonwheels, which previously operated as Option C in the North East of England, is a CIC that has already won the tender to operate car clubs in Newcastle upon Tyne, in addition to its first scheme in Durham, and it may be capable of expanding outside its home region.

¹⁷ Brown, J, *Community Investment - using Industrial & Provident Society legislation*. (Co-operatives UK, 2009)

¹⁸ The company, called Commonwheels, is based in Durham after Option C merged with Leeds-based Commonwheels CIC – another CIC operating in about a dozen town and cities including Oxford and Reading, which was established with funding from the Department for Transport to develop car clubs in places not attractive to the commercial operators.

8. Contribution to government policy objectives

- 8.1 Car clubs have a strategically significant role that has not to date been adequately recognised.
- 8.2 From research undertaken in Britain, it is clear that there is considerable potential for car clubs to contribute to Scottish Government policy objectives if encouraged to grow over the coming decade. Car clubs contribute to cars being taken off the road and to reduced car mileage driven. The car club can contribution to:
- (i) Meeting carbon reduction targets
 - (ii) Meeting air quality targets in major conurbations
 - (iii) Helping employers with travel plans (staff travel)
 - (iv) Reducing use of 'grey fleet'¹⁹ activity, enabling employers to save on staff travel expense, whilst making carbon savings and reducing corporate risk at the same time
 - (v) Achieving greater resilience in smaller communities/neighbourhoods that adopt a shared approach to car use and improving access to essential services
 - (vi) Reducing household costs
 - (vii) Combating social exclusion and reducing inequalities.
- 8.3 Car clubs also offer significant cost benefit advantages in tackling the climate impacts of transport. Atkins/University of Aberdeen (2009) recognised that to develop car clubs in Scotland to over 110,000 members by 2022 would significantly reduce carbon emissions at less cost to the public purse than most other transport measures. In fact car clubs were found to be one of the best value interventions in the study.
- 8.4 Latest consumer research confirms that car clubs contribute to reducing carbon emissions by the way the members use cars. Carplus Trust's 2009 Annual Car Club Member Survey²⁰ showed that car club members tend to reduce car mileage in favour of public transport, walking and cycling.
- 8.5 Even where members have previously not owned a car there is evidence that newly empowered car club members keep their car use significantly below average. The behaviour change that car club membership delivers is reinforced by transparent charging. In particular, this enables members to compare the cost of a car trip with other ways of travelling, and in turn this encourages members to reduce unnecessary car use.
- 8.6 Car clubs provide access to a car based on need rather than as an automatic reflex to undertaking any kind of journey by car. The 2008/09 Carplus Annual Survey²⁰ evidenced that members reduce their car mileage and their household transport bills (by reducing car ownership levels):
- (i) Around a quarter of both members and joiners report that they would have purchased a new car had they not joined a car club;
 - (ii) 39% of all respondents have reduced the number of vehicles owned by their household since joining a car club;
 - (iii) Each car club car is estimated to result in an average of 13 private vehicles being disposed of and the deferral of purchase of a further 9 cars.

¹⁹ Grey fleet - drivers who use their own car for business travel and that sit outside the normal company car policing, reporting and communication channels. These vehicles are often older than company vehicles, with higher emission levels than newer equivalents and fewer safety features.

²⁰ Conducted by Transport Research Laboratory (TRL);
Myers D & Cairns S. 2009 (Transport Research Laboratory) 2008/9 Carplus Annual Survey of Car Club Members.

- 8.7 Car club members reduce their dependence on the car by making use of other modes of travel.²¹ Compared to those not members of car clubs, car club members and joiners make more trips by public transport and walking or cycling, and considerably fewer trips involving a car, lift, taxi or motorbike (16-23% of their journeys, as compared to 66%). For the vast majority of members, car club trips are infrequent, with most reportedly making trips in this way a few times a month or less. The majority of car club vehicles are “low emission” - as the fleet is renewed frequently - and are significantly less polluting than the cars members have given up. Car club vehicles emit less CO₂ than the average car,²² and accreditation and infrastructure serve as a perfect conduit for low carbon innovations.
- 8.8 Transport for London’s marketing campaign has suggested that car clubs can result in a saving of £3,500 per annum. In the review’s workshops we examined the case of an informal community led car club in rural Scotland, Park Carpool in Findhorn, which showed a minimum saving of £1,000 per annum.
- 8.9 Through working with social landlords and other community organisations, car clubs can offer improved access to services for people who do not have access to a car. One successful partnership, London Borough of Greenwich working with Streetcar, has documented the potential level of take-up of car club provision targeted at tenants. In Edinburgh, City Car Club has had some success in working with social landlords. In Glasgow, proposals have already been made to incorporate car club parking in new developments in advance of the scheme being established.²³
- 8.10 Although the assessment of benefits of car club use centres around cost saving and reduced carbon emissions, improved staff efficiency should also be considered. At Easter 2010, over 650 City of Edinburgh Council staff were using car club cars in Edinburgh. They are able to book a car online at the same time as booking a meeting. For certain journeys they may also pick up a car local to their residential base and go straight to the site rather than travel into work in order to pick up their car. Feedback from staff suggests this provides greater efficiency than using their own car or a pool car located at the workplace.
- 8.11 The cost and carbon savings are often significant compared to the use of ‘grey fleet’ and car clubs also reduce the risks associated with payment of mileage allowances for business travel.²⁴

²¹ Myers D & Cairns S. 2009 (Transport Research Laboratory) 2008/9 Carplus Annual Survey of Car Club Members.

²² See presentation by Chris Endacott, Gfleet Services Ltd, comparing the car club vehicles in Edinburgh to “grey fleet” vehicles used on business by members of Edinburgh City Council staff (see www.ratransport.co.uk/postcarclubconf.html report on Edinburgh 2009 conference).

²³ In Edinburgh, for example see Dunedin Canmore Housing Association. In Glasgow, Partick Housing Association have made proposals in a planning application, which included provision for shared cars (interview, February 2010).

²⁴ See case study in the presentations from the Edinburgh Car Club conference held in March 2009 (see www.ratransport.co.uk/postcarclubconf.html web site report on Edinburgh 2009 conference).

9. Low carbon vehicles

- 9.1 The UK government is seeking to expand the market for low emission vehicles. Through the Office for Low Emission Vehicles (OLEV) and its funding for infrastructure, it will support the wide-scale introduction of electric vehicles and plug-in hybrid cars in three to six demonstration areas. Separately, Glasgow is already involved in UK funded low carbon vehicle projects. In discussions with OLEV in December 2009, Carplus suggested that the successful implementation of a demonstration scheme for ultra-low carbon vehicles (ULEV) would have significant synergies with a car club scheme that seeks to popularise the concept of sharing a pool of cars.
- 9.2 The Scottish Government is currently developing its strategy on taking forward low carbon vehicles in Scotland.
- 9.3 In the next decade, the wider use of low emission vehicles is likely to play a significant role in carbon reduction policy. Car clubs may offer one route to the wide adoption of battery electric vehicles and plug-in hybrids. Early adopters of car clubs - both residents and employers - could be a key market for demonstrating the use of ULEVs. In part, the success of such a strategy will be dependent on the reliability and range of the vehicles and the suitability of the technology for use in a car club.
- 9.4 However, there are currently a number of potential barriers to the uptake of ULEVs by car club operators:
- (i) Creation of an on-street EV parking and recharging infrastructure in advance of the wider take-up of electric vehicles
 - (ii) Creation of more off-street parking in new developments by ensuring that recharging points are part of the design brief for new developments.
- 9.5 Car clubs could make use of the plug-in hybrid car for longer journeys and the electric car for local use. Uptake is dependent on two important factors, about which insufficient is known at this stage of their development.
- 9.6 Firstly, there is concern as to whether battery electric vehicles can work successfully in the car club environment. Key issues are the distance to be travelled between scheduled charges, the operational implications of creating a 'back office' system that ensures charges are booked in and take place, and the usual concerns about EV reliability.
- 9.7 Secondly, it may not be practical to meet the additional cost of incorporating EVs into a car club fleet from higher charges to members. As both battery electric vehicles and plug-in hybrids are expected to be more expensive to lease, operators will need to develop a business model that results in acceptable charges to the end user and without third-party assistance to develop the market it will be hard to set a viable tariff.

10. Conclusions

- 10.1 As worldwide fossil fuel shortages arise and energy costs increase, cost-conscious people will be discouraged from using sole occupancy cars. Not only will this raise the demand for public transport, but increase the use of other modes (such as walking and cycling) and popularise travel reduction through other Smarter Choices measures (such as conferencing and the use of car clubs and car sharing). Strong partnerships with public transport operators then become more likely as the affinity between cars clubs and public transport operation becomes more evident. This would be significantly enhanced if car club membership can be integrated into the smart card technology used as a means of access to bus and rail.
- 10.2 A car club support programme would make a considerable difference to the time it would take to establish viable schemes in the four major Scottish cities. It would also ensure that properly evaluated trials were established in a range of smaller market towns and other Scottish rural communities.
- 10.3 It is likely that some common services will be required for projects in the smaller localities. For example, by assisting with access to in-car technology, online booking facilities and the facility to get billing data downloaded locally, it would be possible for new entrants to the market to offer a high quality service without having to make a significant investment in these expensive 'back office' functions. In fact there may be an option to share back office facilities. This would allow local co-ops or companies to concentrate on securing and maintaining the vehicles, and on local marketing and membership services.

Urban car clubs

- 10.4 In the largest Scottish cities, the establishment and accelerated growth of urban car clubs could be assisted with a modest intervention programme concentrated on infrastructure support, public awareness and shared innovation.
- 10.5 The market will attract operators to set up in the most attractive cities (based on elements identified in the Zipcar report - see footnote 8). But the delivery of public policy objectives requires the facilitation of good links with public transport policies and proper integration with urban design and parking policies. This requires the private and public sector working together at all stages of planning, design and implementation.
- 10.6 Lessons should be learned from the Transport for London model of support for the London boroughs and their partner operators. The availability of funding in London to support infrastructure and marketing initiatives is important. Equally, standards have been raised, alongside rapid expansion of the network infrastructure. Effective networking has been established, with technical support provided to new authorities entering into the programme. TfL's intervention can taper off, as the infrastructure requirements and the standard-setting become a permanent feature of car club development in the city-region.
- 10.7 With the support of those engaged in planning decisions, the design of new housing and commercial developments should embrace new thinking about parking requirements. Over the past decade, we have seen a change in The City of Edinburgh where the adoption of supplementary planning guidance has made a difference. More use has been made of car club parking to reduce the levels of residential and visitor parking required in many developments. Developers in inner urban areas are often keen to offer parking provision for car clubs through off-street parking or by funding parking bays located on street.

- 10.8 The establishment of dedicated on-street parking bays for car clubs has worked best in areas covered by a residents parking zone or Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ). In working with a developer or employer to adopt car club parking, there may be a need to introduce a CPZ, with the costs met by a charge on the developer or employer. For example, the planning agreement covering Grand Union Village in west London, includes a possible charge on the developer for the costs of implementing a CPZ if parking from the Village spilled over into neighbouring streets.
- 10.9 In Scotland, once the objectives of a support programme for the larger conurbations are set, there is a lot that can be done to support complementary initiatives in smaller towns and rural communities.

Small town and rural car club schemes

- 10.10 In smaller cities and market towns, new operators - possibly formed as consumer co-operatives or employee-owned businesses - may be needed to take up the challenge, rather than expecting the existing commercial operators to be interested. There may also be scope in some rural communities for community run schemes provided they operate largely with volunteer staff.
- 10.11 Although difficult to establish, there are examples of successful car clubs in small market towns in England. There may also be new opportunities in the next few years as the car club market develops. For instance, the core of a new scheme could be a contract for the car club operator to provide vehicles for public sector staff business travel, thereby underpinning the community part of the scheme.
- 10.12 To operate successfully as a business in a small town or rural community, it is clear from the experience of independent car clubs in England, that new rural car clubs in Scotland would need financial support and access to technical advice in the setting up phase.
- 10.13 Such independent car clubs also need community “champions” to co-ordinate and promote all aspects of feasibility research, implementation and marketing.

11. Recommendations

- 11.1 The key recommendation of the review is for a co-ordinated support programme over at least 4 years to deliver accelerated development in the main conurbations - ensuring that urban car club operations become viable more quickly and rural operations have time to develop sound foundations. In smaller towns and rural areas the objectives over this period would be to support the development of 6 to 10 demonstration schemes that in some respects work together using similar ICT systems and insurance. Although the proposed programme would not finance the full costs of the rural development, it would help with feasibility and practical support and provide match funding to leverage other sources of grant and loans.
- 11.2 The key contribution of this programme is in accelerating the process from start up to viability. It will attract private sector investment (commercial operators) and community investment (independent, community and co-operative operators) and will largely be market driven after the support programme is complete.
- 11.3 An effective programme would help to establish parking infrastructure in cities. Some of this will take years to establish once planning applications with provision for car club parking are approved. For the car club to form part of the design of new housing and mixed developments, there would need to be supportive land-use planning policies.
- 11.4 The delivery of the support programme and the proposed budget is outlined below in Table A. It is based on a 3 to 4 year programme of development, recognising how the process of change is relatively slow to begin with in the planning and delivery of infrastructure, letting of tenders and recruitment of members.

Table A: Scottish Car Club Support Programme (3 – 4 year programme to 2014/15)

Element	Output	Overall cost (£)	Contribution - delivery	Contribution - staffing
Infrastructure support	Parking bays for car club vehicles	850,000	400,000	200,000
Public awareness	Generic marketing and signage	280,000	150,000	50,000
Accreditation, data gathering and good practice seminars	Working with operators and LAs	135,000	25,000	100,000
Community support	Development and practical (e.g. systems)	510,000	240,000	240,000
Informal car clubs and public information	Information provision and networking	50,000	10,000	35,000
Totals		1,825,000	825,000	625,000

Note: Assumes contribution to Overall Cost of £375,000 from other sources (e.g. local authority, charitable foundations, and community investment).

- 11.5 In the period of the programme, we would expect car clubs to be recognised as part of a response to reducing car dependency. In particular, there is a need for car club parking to be accommodated near to transport hubs and for efforts to continue to develop a more integrated approach with bus and rail operators.
- 11.6 The projected growth of car clubs in Scotland is not easy to estimate but the following table shows how expansion to 25,000 members by 2014/15 takes place from the existing level of just over 3,000 members. This assumes the proposed support programme is accepted and builds on the current interest in three of Scotland's largest cities. It assumes that during this 4-year period, the programme takes root in Dundee and in a few small towns and rural communities, mainly through the demonstration programme, that will in some locations, build on work already undertaken by communities using Climate Challenge Fund grants.

Table B: Scotland Car Club Support Programme: Projected Membership (2009-2014)

	Edinburgh only	Scotland - no support	Scotland - with support
Members 2009	3,000	n/a	n/a
Members by 2010	4,200	4,500	4,500
Members by 2011 (1 year)	5,600	6,600	7,000
Members by 2012 (2 years)	7,000	8,000	10,500
Members by 2013 (3 years)	9,000	11,500	16,000
Members by 2014 (4 years)	12,000	16,500	25,000
Carbon savings (tonnes CO₂ pa) in 2014	12,480	17,160	26,000

Based on calculations from Carplus produced in 2009. Combining the effect of fewer miles driven in a more efficient car creates savings of 1.04 tonnes CO₂ per member per year in the UK.

- 11.7 If the programme is effectively implemented from 2011, we believe the car club sector will grow steadily from its present level to about 25,000 members. A range of factors support the planned growth, including the favourable characteristics of the two main cities - Edinburgh and Glasgow - in respect of urban density, good public transport, on-street parking availability, levels of car ownership and social demographics. The potential growth in these cities has some parallels with recent growth in London, where membership exceeds 85,000.
- 11.8 A slower take-up is likely in Aberdeen and Dundee, which will start later and will need to establish support with employers and suitable higher density residential areas to launch the schemes. Given some central support for parking infrastructure and public awareness-raising, the schemes planned for these cities will benefit from the existence of larger schemes in the central belt, particularly if there is reciprocal membership available, similar to well-established schemes in Switzerland, Belgium and Germany involving bus operators, rail operators and local councils. Volatile fuel prices will act as a catalyst for behaviour change, alongside government-backed incentives to reduce transport carbon emissions. Car club membership in Scotland is expected to be over 25,000 by 2015.
- 11.9 The above projections are consistent with the longer-term projections contained within the Atkins/University of Aberdeen (2009) report. In its assessment of the potential of car clubs it projects a growth to 110,000 households in membership by 2027 (central assumptions) and 2022 (ambitious assumptions)²⁵. The report also suggests that car club membership could be targeted at market towns with more than 25,000 population.

²⁵ Atkins/University of Aberdeen (2009) also sets an intermediate projection for 2017. It suggests that 27,500 households (55,000 ambitious) would be participants in the car club programme.

12. Budget

- 12.1 The Scottish car club support programme outlined above in Table A aims to target limited resources at schemes most able to demonstrate an effective plan of action.
- 12.2 The proposed programme would require a budget of £1.825m over up to 4 years. This assumes a contribution of £375,000 from other sources (e.g. local authority, charitable foundations, and community investment). Around 45% would be allocated to local authority costs (parking infrastructure) and local community champions (for feasibility and development work and matching funding).
- 12.3 The delivery of the programme would largely be built on to the work of existing organisations best placed to move quickly to ensure the programme can be used effectively from an early stage.

Infrastructure support

- 12.4 The proposed programme would support the costs of establishing on-street parking infrastructure in urban local authorities. As the legal and consultation costs, signage, road markings are estimated at between £1,000 and £2,000 per parking bay (depending on how many are completed in a batch), funding would assist with delivery of approximately 400 bays at £1,000 each to accelerate the establishment of the parking infrastructure.
- 12.5 There will also be a need to build up expertise in assessing applications for support. It is recommended this should be established within those Regional Transport Partnerships covering larger urban areas which could have an instrumental role in co-ordinating regional effort. The proposed budget includes an element for the additional staff costs involved in managing elements of the car club support programme.

Public awareness

- 12.6 An important element of funding is earmarked for public awareness. Delegates at the consultation events suggested several ideas for improving the visibility of car clubs as a complementary mode to public transport. Getting the concept more widely recognised will require use of a generic on-street car club parking bay sign and some generic marketing. This in turn will assist with the challenge of keeping dedicated parking bays free of illegal parking - a problem for busy urban locations and tourist centres alike. This funding could be managed by Scottish Government or RTPs, with advice from Carplus, with implementation by an agency with expertise in social marketing.
- 12.7 A market research company will be commissioned to conduct before and after surveys to establish the impact of the public awareness work, especially to document whether the desired higher profile for car clubs has been achieved.

Quality control: accreditation, data gathering and good practice seminars

- 12.8 Operators and local authorities will need to co-operate in a programme of accreditation and data gathering, to ensure a credible system exists for publishing performance data and analysing behavioural impacts. Carplus Trust handles this activity currently for both Transport for London and the Department for Transport, with the support of car club operators. Recent annual data analysis has been undertaken for Carplus by the Transport Research Laboratory (TRL). We recommend that UK standards are adopted for the support programme.
- 12.9 A small amount of funding has therefore been proposed for accreditation, data gathering, good practice seminars and encouraging stakeholders to network effectively.

Community support

- 12.10 It is recommended that the development of car clubs in smaller towns and rural communities should form a separate part of the proposed programme. This will require more intervention requiring a mixture of community development and business development skills.
- 12.11 Local initiatives need a form of direct development support. The programme proposes funds for staff and overheads, as well as matched grant funding for car club establishment costs. Through directing support to a carefully selected range of between 6 and 10 demonstration projects, visible results should be achievable by the end of the programme. The key will be to locate schemes where there is a real prospect of achieving a degree of self-sustaining car club activity by the completion of the support programme. In 2010/11 work on capacity-building would ideally take place alongside stimulating interest in target communities, some of whom are already considering a car club option as a result of support received through the CCF grant programme.
- 12.12 It is recognised that this part of the programme will need to be established in a way that is complementary to and carries on from the work of the CCF.
- 12.13 The support package provided to rural communities and small towns will need to seek ways of reducing the cost of entry to the market for small enterprises, by engaging in some degree of common procurement, at least of back office services. There is scope for sharing open source software already developed for billing functions. The proposed programme should have access to a wealth of knowledge about car clubs and co-operatives through Carplus and Cooperative Development Scotland respectively.
- 12.14 It is recommended that this part of the proposed programme best fits with an existing NGO that has experience of environmental development work, is used to responding to community-based initiatives, and has good working partnerships with local authorities and RTPs where appropriate.

Informal car clubs and public information

- 12.15 There is a need for information and advice and material to assist informal car club activity, some of which may progress to a community scheme. A small element of funding has been allocated to this part of the proposed programme, to be provided under the rural communities and/or quality control elements outlined above.

13. Delivery of the Car Club Support Programme

- 13.1 The options outlined here are intended to show how a support programme of several elements could be delivered by one or more bodies. Each of the options suggested has strengths that relate to different elements of the proposed programme.

Option 1 - Regional Transport Partnerships

- 13.2 Car club schemes should be encouraged to grow to supply services to a conurbation - and potentially to the towns in its hinterland. Car clubs do not stop at local government boundaries. In recognition of the regional element in car club development it would be an option for programmatic support (funding and practical assistance) to be managed through the appropriate RTPs.

- 13.3 This approach was welcomed by RTPs which have expressed interest in car club development. Participants in the consultation workshops also indicated that this approach would help local authorities (and other public sector employers) to collaborate, to contribute some of the cost and officer time, to share knowledge and experience, and work together where car club markets cross local authority boundaries.

Option 2 - Carplus Trust

- 13.4 An NGO or NGOs could play a part in the development work and delivery of some aspects of a proposed programme. This work would complement Option 1.

- 13.5 One candidate would be Carplus Trust. It is a well established charity that promotes car clubs and car sharing and works closely in support of local authority partners, operators and other bodies and companies in its membership across all sectors.

- 13.6 Carplus runs the UK accreditation systems for operators that is used by local authorities and developers and it has provided these services to TfL. Currently it receives support from DfT as well as some project funding from foundations and regional public bodies, such as TfL.

Option 3 - A national NGO

- 13.7 We are aware of half a dozen communities that have shown interest in car clubs through the Scottish Government's Climate Challenge Fund. They may be encouraged to work together to ensure that the challenge of implementing a scheme is shared. To foster a stronger presence in rural Scotland there will be a need to undertake some information, support and development work in small towns and selected island and rural communities. A more supportive response to the interest shown by a number of rural communities would give them more confidence to apply and make it more likely they move beyond the feasibility study stage. This need for a more pro-active rural support programme could possibly link to future Climate Challenge Funds.

- 13.8 Informal discussions have been held with Changeworks, an Edinburgh-based environmental charity involved in waste reduction, recycling and energy advice. It provided consultancy services in the late 1990s in the preparatory work for the car club in Edinburgh.

- 13.9 Changeworks is now delivering environmental services in the Lothians, Fife and the Highlands and the Islands. An experienced NGO like Changeworks would be capable of hosting a programme of support and development rural of car clubs, working with communities as well as Carplus and the RTPs.

- 13.10 It is possible that other national NGOs like Community Energy Scotland or the Community Transport Association (CTA) in Scotland could also deliver such a programme.

Appendix 1: Summary of Workshop Responses

1. Key points from the consultations

- 1.1 Approximately 100 people participated through the workshops, roundtable event and/or made submissions or participated in interviews. Those who participated were from regional transport partnerships, local authority officers (transport, parking, environmental health, and fleet management) and councillors, transport consultants, academics, NGOs, community organisations, health service managers, developers, planners and car club operators.
- 1.2 By holding regional events in Inverness and Perth we were able to attract stakeholders from smaller communities and explore the potential application of car clubs to small towns and rural communities as well as reviewing the potential benefits of car clubs in urban Scotland.
- 1.3 The key points that emerged from the regional consultations (and other individual consultations) are outlined below. It is clear that those consulted were generally supportive of a co-ordinated support programme that recognised the benefits of collaborative working across RTPs and local authorities, as well as between community-based car clubs.
- 1.4 There was consensus that relatively small scale funding for infrastructure, promotion and technical guidance would act as a catalyst in helping to kick start activity in new areas and serve to showcase demonstration schemes.
- 1.5 It was also recognised that development activity will in urban areas largely be sustained - after a period of initial support of approximately 2-3 years - by continued growth of demand and funded by profitable schemes.
- 1.6 A support programme needs to encourage and reward the creation of effective schemes which will eventually be capable of self sustaining operation, supported by a local partnership that ensures ongoing engagement between local authorities and operators, and other interested parties.
- 1.7 Key points from the regional workshop and consultations:
- *Better integration of car clubs with public transport.* Included planning for an integrated payment system within current smart card initiatives.²⁶
 - *Support for dedicated parking.* Included simplification of the process of introducing dedicated car club parking; support for local authorities with initial costs of developing the parking infrastructure and signage; possible integration of car club parking with introduction of charging points for electric vehicles
 - *Integration of employer car pools with car clubs.* Included car clubs to serve needs of local residents and SMEs when not used by council staff; securing participation of other public employers (e.g. NHS, SNH, higher education); provide funding support to analyse opportunities for cost and carbon savings and “needs analysis”.

²⁶ This point reflects progress with integration in cities such as Hanover and Bremen, Germany.

- *Raise awareness of cost implications of legal car ownership and use.* Included targeting potential car buyers by age and through used car sales. Young drivers face pressure to get a car but have to pay high premiums. If over-19s join the car club they may postpone car ownership – but car club premiums may also rise.
- *Improve awareness of car club “mode”.* Included social marketing aimed at positioning car clubs as complementary to public transport; creating a stronger branding or awareness of it as a transport mode.
- *Improved incentives for people and SMEs to join a car club.* Included converting the scrappage scheme to offering a bus pass and car club membership package; also possible tax benefits to employees and employer parallel to cycling to work incentives.
- *Car club operators to offer short-term trials, loyalty schemes and reciprocal membership.* Included operators to provide this in return for assistance with initial infrastructure and marketing.
- *Establish a car club support programme* to enable car club development to be accelerated and better co-ordinated. Included making funding and technical support available and offering support with parking and infrastructure in major cities. Elsewhere this included supporting technology, insurance and provide guidance including a “kit” and “standard operating procedures”. Assistance could include developing “open source” software support to communities would also encourage more bids to future CCF.
- *Consolidating visitors and locals in island communities.* Included a car club for local users and visitors; could also serve public sector visitors.²⁷

2. Barriers to car club development

To understand the barriers to car club development, we asked our car club operators to discuss their experience at the regional workshops²⁸.

Barriers in urban areas

Keith Stark, City Car Club’s Manager in Scotland, described the barriers facing his company in setting up a new car club in Glasgow. This was prepared prior to the announcement that the Glasgow City Council is working on a tender specification for commercial operators:

- Difficulty identifying decision makers;
- No budget allocated for car clubs;
- Car club deemed to be low priority;
- Difficulty in accepting that car clubs alleviate parking pressures as opposed to creating them;
- Reluctance to give up parking spaces;
- Lack of knowledge about car clubs.

²⁷ For example Scottish Natural Heritage, which has staff working throughout Scotland and to reduce its carbon impacts is actively looking at its staff travel options.

²⁸ To view full presentations in full see <http://www.ratransport.co.uk/ccdevscot1.html>

Barriers in rural areas

Jeremy Farr, Manager of Moorcar in South Devon, described the barriers facing operators in small towns and rural communities. Posing the question “Why are rural car clubs different from city based clubs?”, he said:

- Initial capital costs to set up scheme;
- Delayed response before a potential member joins;
- Members will join if they live on average within 1,000m of car club parking (Moorcar reckons that is more like 100m);
- Parking congestion in small historic town centres;
- Unfamiliarity with car club concept;
- Absolute need to have reliable access to a car club car.

In outlining the barriers facing new operators he identified the following:

- High cost of start-up;
- High ratio of cars to member - Rural 1:9 & Urban 1:25;
- Long lead time for recruitment;
- Lower charging rates;
- High unit cost internet booking system;
- Higher cost larger vehicles (members take more long journeys with more passengers).

He discussed the nature of the local population and suggested that the rural small market town demographics include:

- Higher percentage of self-employed working from home;
- Overall lower disposable income;
- Incomers with greener lifestyle choices;
- Indigenous rural residents:
 - rely on private/independent transport
 - challenged by proposition to remove private access to cars
 - new services “passing fad, new fangled ways.”

Conclusions of a rural car club pilot programme

In the Perth regional workshop the unpublished evidence of a car club covering a series of villages was used to contribute to the understanding of car clubs successes and failures in rural communities.²⁹ This 6-car pilot programme in North Somerset provided a summary of lessons learnt by the “champion” of the scheme:

- Make sure member(s) have a financial stake in the club;
- Get support of local (green) group(s) and council(s);

²⁹ See <http://www.dragonflyermobility.co.uk>

- Don't "push" the cars – try to generate "pull";
- Market, market, market (raise awareness);
- Local champion(s);
- Local business support vital (sponsor, support, subsidy, usage);
- Right vehicle (safe, reliable, green, versatile, convenient);
- Right community (size, profile, location, layout);
- Be patient (5 year planning horizon);
- Be creative...

3. Opportunities for Car Club development

Opportunities for car clubs in urban areas

The components of a successful car club according to Keith Stark, City Car Club, are:

- Strong partnership between council and car club
- Close relationship with planners & developers
- Experienced operator
- Good public transport infrastructure
- Prominent on-street parking bay locations
- Good mix of business and private members
- Large urban environment
- Strong parking enforcement

Opportunities for car clubs in rural areas and small towns

The Moorcar case study suggested that to survive the first three years the operator needs:

- Stamina
- To recognise the long lead times for recruitment
- Use local networks to generate confidence and awareness
- Capitalise on customer satisfaction:
 - Word of mouth is the best advertising
 - One bad experience/everyone knows
 - A local voice, knowledgeable, available 24/7

Opportunities outlined on a thematic basis

The opportunities for car clubs identified in the workshops are outlined here on a thematic basis. Inevitably, there is a degree of overlap with the points made in the small group workshops about the support programme.

Car club contribution to meeting policy targets 1

Policy target	Car club contribution
Modal shift	Encourage modal shift - removing cars from network
Reduced emissions	Make the real cost of travel more apparent - reduce emissions
Reduce car use	Stem increasing car usage in towns well served by public transport
Incentives	Create incentives for taking cars off the road
Emission targets	Use Climate Act targets for transport as catalyst
Low carbon operation	Complex issues - use Climate Change Act to provide leverage to promote carbon benefit of car clubs
Carbon rationing	Possible carbon rationing to promote uptake of car clubs as part of low carbon strategy. Favour fossil fuel-free cars.
Monitor employers	Monitor car clubs carbon reduction contribution to employers targets
Social inclusion	Increases mobility - access to services and activities (for people with low incomes).
Community development	Sharing of resources creates more sense of community

Car club contribution to meeting policy targets 2

Activity	Car club to contribution
Land use planning	Town planning needs to give more consideration to transport hubs. Needs regulation to ensure transport operators to work together to be successful.
Integration	Public transport links to car clubs needed
Ticketing 1	Strategic Review provides framework for ticketing
Ticketing 2	Possibility of integrated ticketing using smart card.
Ticketing 3	Look at linking to <i>Wayfarer</i> for a plan
Integration with public transport	Public transport hubs promote integration by bringing together all transport modes/choices (inc. car clubs)
Hubs	Need to reorganise public transport as interchange based rather than route based with hubs and multi-modal transport options
Funding hubs	Financial support for these hubs from private operators
Multi-modal ticketing	Integration between public transport operators and car club schemes needs multi-modal ticketing
Smart cards	Integrated transport hubs and multi-modal smart cards to pay for it including a salary sacrifice option

Car club customer targets

Target	Where and who?
Target locations	High density housing
Target non-commuters	Not for commuting - unless car is taken to work destination as part of a pooling scheme at the workplace
Target young	Young people who have not bought first car
Targeting two car households	Car clubs suit those who are considering owning 2 cars - especially in rural communities to avoid second car is a large cost saving
Council staff travel and local communities	Establish council staff travel option using pool cars. Car club allows use by local community (e.g. living or working within 800 yards of central parking location)

Car clubs and social marketing

Target	Commentary
Social marketing 1	Image of car clubs needs to be boosted by positioning as part of public transport.
Social marketing 2	Car manufacturers glamorise car ownership; need to see social marketing of "social responsibility" from government.
Promotion	Promote car club services through Transport Direct and Traveline.

Car club targets

Criteria	Essential requirements
1	Easy to use.
2	Low carbon emissions.
3	Introduce electric cars for short journeys and petrol cars for longer ones.
4	Attractive (iconic?) and low carbon (e.g. Fiat 500 or Mini).

Car club operational opportunities

Activity	Examples
Shared software	Experience of Park Carpool (Moray) in using tested accounts software may be possible to syndicate more widely, like open source software.
Technology	Car clubs supported to move into using versatile new technology and helped to procure good technology.
Insurance	Sort out insurance cover on a national basis for community schemes to use.
Shared electric cars	Monitor Clim-Atic pilot programme in Badenoch and Strathspey for acceptability of electric cars and sharing systems.

4. A support programme for Car Clubs

Car club support in urban areas

The City Car Club case study suggested their preferred input from local authorities:

- Parking
- Provision of prominent on-street parking bays
- Promotion
- Promote use of the car club to Council staff & general public
- Publicity
- Publicise the car club through council publications.
- Planning
- Use Section 75 notices to allow developers to provide low car developments
- Participation
- Corporate account, for use by staff on Council business, to 'anchor' the car club

Car club support in rural areas

The Moorcar case study outlined their suggested requirements:

- Access to capital
- Engaging new audiences,
- Visibility - importance of Moorcar as a brand
- Parking
- Working with local authorities:
 - re-allocating parking spaces
 - converting grey fleet
 - ring-fencing S106 agreement funds
- Strategic links with other transport providers
- Real partnership working with councils

The four regional workshops discussed the implications of the issues identified in the sessions analysing barriers and opportunities. The need for a support programme was accepted as an essential prerequisite of a vibrant car club network and the following areas of support were identified:

Meeting targets

Climate policy targets	Support for Low Carbon Vehicles to include car clubs as part of promoting climate strategy
Promote low carbon vehicles	Needs to be part of national, linked programme for maximum impact on adoption of car clubs
Improve air quality	Car clubs help meet Air Quality targets - grants for Low Emission Zones to support expansion of car clubs
Traffic reduction targets	Make use of Traffic Reduction Act to support car clubs
Guidance	Improved guidance re climate targets to include support for car clubs. Include in Council's Single Outcome Agreement targets. Include car clubs in National Performance Indicators

Funding and technical support (national and regional)

National programme	Provide funding for car club start up, further development - and generic promotion.
Central initiative	Based on a national solution – need for a bold approach possibly through a Car Club Scotland initiative via Transport Scotland
Funding targeted	Ring-fencing of Scottish Government funding - need to target money to achieve objectives
Regional programme	Establish funding mechanism with RTPs managing the budget
Increase support for sustainable transport	Ring fence within Sustainable Transport budgets; support increased funding for sustainable transport modes
Car clubs as example of LCV	Use car clubs to set example (e.g. in use of ultra low carbon vehicles)

Incentives to promote car clubs

To public 1	Extend car scrappage scheme to all old cars to be swapped for a bus pass + car club membership
To public 2	Introduce Car club membership tax benefit (like cycle to work benefit)
To business	Tax credits to reward businesses who share resources

Support for communities

Funding car club development	Funding for start ups and for expansion. Based on a national solution - need for a bold approach possibly through a Car Club Scotland initiative via Transport Scotland
Support to communities 1	Training and awareness-raising for future CCF Projects needed. Encourage more communities to apply for funding from CCF to develop car clubs.
Support to communities 2	Provide package of advice, resources for community groups
Non-CCF projects	Funding for non-CCF projects to carry out feasibility studies
Social enterprise	Social enterprise funding to start up car clubs - get over funding gap in first few years

Community car clubs - support mechanisms

Kit	"Kit of parts" to help communities and CCF Projects set up car clubs
Open source systems	Subsidise the development of open source systems for car clubs including telematics
Standard procedures	Standing Operating Procedures – Scottish Government to support programme accessible for all clubs to use (e.g. paperwork, contracts, and systems).

Planning and development

Local Authority Planning	Use S.75 planning conditions on new developments for parking infrastructure
Developers	Show how car club access is a selling point for flats in city and town centres

Parking

On-street parking for car clubs	Unlock (simplify) and speed-up process for establishing on-street parking bays for car clubs
Parking charges	Increase car parking charges to discourage non car club users
Parking	Local authorities need convincing of benefits of car clubs to offer parking spaces for car clubs
Local Authority Parking 1	Create a priority for on-street parking for car clubs. Provide on-street parking bays backed by TROs. Ensure it's free.
Local Authority Parking 2	Enforce parking control in off-street bays in housing developments
Parking Permits	Provide financial incentives to parking permit holders (residents/businesses) to encourage them to give up permit for car club membership
Central parking bays	Use council as anchor tenant in small town with council offices - assured parking bays
Parking enforcement	Improve parking supervision. Decriminalisation not everywhere so cars could get blocked

Public transport integration

Car clubs as public transport	Car clubs to become Public Transport operators and join travel card forum with bus and rail operators
Payment integration	Design simpler multi-modal ticket system to include rail bus city car and bike hire
Link to other modes	Encourage link to more incentives - bike hire, car loan for tourists
Simplify options	Simplify public transport offering through integration
Bus lane use	Allow car club vehicles in bus lane (assuming clearly marked as car club vehicle for enforcement purposes)

Public sector staff travel and car pools

Local Authorities - staff travel	Become corporate members; high profile use involving council leader and service directors
Other employers staff travel	Persuade other public sector bodies to become car club customers for suitable staff travel needs
Change staff transport	Pool cars funded – organisations to use instead of mileage claims from employees
Public agencies	Encourage joint working of public agencies to facilitate shared vehicle use (+ sharing with community)
National procurement	National leasing arrangements for car clubs and employers pool cars run as car clubs. Savings and benefits from national leadership.
Council involvement	Share pool of car club cars with neighbourhood - residents and employers
Local Integration	Car clubs and Local Authority pool cars to form an integrated package
Link users of pooled cars	Link potential partners to encourage pooling of cars - CCF projects, councils, large employers. Brokerage of car club fleets - to “fuel” car schemes.
Shared cars	Pooling by employers and with communities. Supported by SNH involving volunteers, businesses and partners.

Raising awareness

Promotion	Promote car clubs in local policy – need for a framework of targets and indicators
Support awareness	Create a recognised national travel brand
Education	Identify car clubs as a “mode” of transport
Target audience	Reach target audience for car clubs through joint programmes led by RTPs
Advertising promotion	Raise awareness of car clubs role in non-urban settings
Theme 1	Use of vehicle appropriate for purpose – pay for what you need/use.
Theme 2	Freedom of choice
Theme 3	Car club members become more conscious about choice of transport and results in cars being used more frugally
Theme 4	Results in fewer cars on local streets

Travel marketing

Travel planning	Integrated with green journey planners (like in TfL)
1 to 1 assistance	Travel marketing (1 to 1) available to every individual/family in Scotland to promote options
Highlight costs of motoring and other modes	Promote other choices of travel by campaign on how much it costs to run a car
Raise profile of "real costs"	Information about real costs per mile of car use - "it's greater than you think!" Get the message across

Operators

Operators support	Support to encourage roaming (reciprocal membership)
Trial	Trial of car club (one week or one month)
VIPs	Promote car clubs membership to VIPs. Free trial membership to MSPs
Loyalty	Loyalty scheme to encourage users
Reciprocal membership	Link car clubs - Edinburgh, Aberdeen so that members can use cars in each place
Link to ride-share	Encourage car club members to ride share
Low carbon cars 1	Encourage sales through car clubs
Low carbon cars 2	Variety of models offered

Appendix 2: Roundtable Consultation

Two concluding workshop were held as part of the Roundtable Consultation, held at Scottish Government, Leith on 15th January 2010 to discuss the draft conclusions of this report. The following are the notes taken from the two workshops.

1. Rural workshop 1

- 1.1 What criteria would apply for the proposed demonstration project for rural communities and market towns?
- 1.2 Density of population in a community is a significant factor required for location of a car club car. Communities that are too sparsely populated do not have enough potential users within 10 minutes walk of the car
- 1.3 Some people commute to work by modes other than car (e.g. bike, bus, rail, ferry)
- 1.4 The community champion is important to rally support for a car club
- 1.5 Market towns - Dumfries is working on a model that would be based on the public sector users working together to form a core of business for an operator
- 1.6 Cars could form the basis of cars that are also shared with community users
- 1.7 Transport funding should be targeted to where demand is
- 1.8 DRT and community car schemes are both useful as complementary functions to a car club
- 1.9 The potential for collaboration with Community Transport was flagged up to make it possible to encourage more employment in rural communities. The digital hub project was outlined as a way of harnessing technology to avoid the need to travel. In rural areas car clubs could also promote ridesharing.
- 1.10 The low threshold model was discussed as a way of minimising the risks. The set up and operating costs of a new car club can be kept to a minimum by sharing systems, by using newer used cars and potentially, by starting with members own cars used during their down time by other members.
- 1.11 Syndicated technology in this context means sharing the procurement or contacting of back office and booking systems together with the potential to bring in on board telematics at a later stage. Insurance can also work more effectively if there is a common system as it permits reciprocal membership
- 1.12 Once a feasibility study is completed and is broadly favourable there is a need for pump prime funding for initial cars and the systems/technology.
- 1.13 Development work will be needed to develop the capacity of around 6 - 10 communities that could be assisted to develop demonstration projects. Their size might range from 1,000 people to nearly 40,000 people.

2. Urban Workshop 1

- 2.1 Parking. Is on-street parking the only option? Off-street parking more central to infrastructure in some other countries (e.g. Germany). Larger schemes with lots of parking spaces allow for parking anywhere available in a zone and use mobile phone to locate nearest parked car to pick up from.
- 2.2 Specially designed parking integrated with bike parking, public transport stops and taxis - Bremen has a mobil-punkt (mobility point)
- 2.3 What is in a car club support programme?
- A - Income Stream : Local Authority to Car Club and vice versa?**
- (i) Parking – car club may pay an annual charge for dedicated parking bay. Developers may pay a one off charge (£75) to fund a parking bay (on street or off-street). LAs will spend from £1 – 2K to set up an on-street parking bay
 - (ii) Lease cars – car club may lease through Council (using AAA LA credit rating) to ensure fleet supply for cars in the pool that staff use for business travel.
 - (iii) Council pays car club for pool car use - revenue savings following review of business use of cars (user allowances, hire cars and taxis)
- B - On-going revenue costs of car club to Local Authority**
- (i) Parking enforcement including checking of permit system issued annually or at intervals to car club operators
 - (ii) Maintenance of parking bay signs, surface painting etc. Occasional closure of bays needs consultation and advanced notification of operators and through operator of members
 - (iii) Loss of parking revenue, through conversion of on-street or off-street parking bays, is a potential factor at start of car club programme
- 2.4 ScotRail Franchise 2014 is to be let by Scottish Government. Need to make car club spaces available near transport hubs.

Appendix 3: Workshop Conclusions

1 Regional Workshop Format

The following outline was used in the four regional workshops to establish the responses of contributors and participants. The “barriers” section was largely contributed by local champions and operators of car clubs. The summary of “opportunities” and “support programme” are based on the results of small group working in each of the four workshops in response to the issues outlined in the table below.

Section	Questions to participants
Barriers	Summarise the barriers - are our conclusions different split between big city/small market town/small rural community?
Opportunities	Identifying the opportunities for car clubs 1. What do car clubs do best to contribute to mobility and reducing carbon emissions and modal shift? 2. What are the best locations - density, demography, transport links? 3. What types of user/journey are they best suited for - workplace and leisure? 4. What vehicle types work best - do electric cars figure in the plans?
Support programme	What would help create a more supportive environment for starting/expanding car clubs? Towards a programme of support and support programme (small groups) How best to overcome barriers and maximize opportunities 1. Big cities 2. Smaller towns 3. Community schemes

2 Workshop 1: Glasgow (02.11.09)

Opportunities

Modal shift	Encourage modal shift - removing cars from network
Reduced emissions	Make the real cost of travel more apparent - reduce emissions
Integration	Public transport links to car clubs needed
Community development	Sharing of resources creates more sense of community
Social inclusion	Increases mobility - access to services and activities (for people with low incomes).
Target locations	High density housing
Target audience 1	Not for commuting - unless car is taken to work destination as part of a pooling scheme at the workplace
Target audience 2	Young people who have not bought first car
Vehicle types 1	Easy to use
Vehicle types 2	Low carbon emission
Vehicle types 3	Introduce electric cars for short journeys and petrol cars for longer ones

Opportunities

Scottish Government support 1	Provide funding for car club start up, further development - and generic promotion
SG support 2	Establish funding mechanism through RTPs
SG support 3	Improved guidance re climate targets to include support for car clubs
SG support 4	Make use of Traffic Reduction Act to support car clubs
SG support 5	Include car clubs in targets (e.g Single Outcome Agreements)
Public transport	Car clubs to become a Public Transport operator and joins travelcard forum with bus and rail operators
Bus lane use	Allow car club vehicles in bus lane
Parking permits for car clubs	Unlock (simplify) and speed-up process for establishing car club permits on dedicated on-street parking bays
Piloting innovation	Use car clubs to set example (e.g. in use of ultra low carbon vehicles)
Incentives to public 1	Extend car scrappage scheme to all old cars to be swapped for a bus pass + car club membership
Incentives to public 2	Introduce Car club membership tax benefit (like cycle to work benefit)
Operators support	Support to encourage roaming (reciprocal membership)
Developers	Show how car club access is a selling point for flats in city and town centres
Local Authority Planning	Use S.75 planning conditions on new developments for parking infrastructure
Local Authority Parking 1	Create a priority for on-street parking for car clubs. Ensure it's free
Local Authority Parking 2	Enforce parking control in off-street bays in housing developments
Parking Permits	Provide financial incentives to parking permit holders (residents/businesses) to encourage them to give up permit for car club membership
Parking infrastructure	Provide on-street parking bays backed by TROs
Local Authorities - staff travel	Become corporate members; high profile use involving council leader and service directors
Other employers staff travel	Persuade other public sector bodies to become car club customers for suitable staff travel needs
Promoting car clubs 1	Use of vehicle appropriate for purpose - pay for what you need/use.
Promoting car clubs 2	Freedom of choice
Promoting car clubs 3	Car club members become more conscious about choice of transport and results in cars being used more frugally
Promoting car clubs 4	Results in fewer cars on local streets

3 Workshop 2 Inverness 03.11.09

Barriers

Scottish Government 1	No guidance for Local Authorities
SG 2	No planning guidance on car clubs in new developments

Opportunities

Ticketing 1	Strategic Review provides framework for ticketing
Ticketing 2	Possibility of integrated ticketing using smart card.
Ticketing 3	Look at linking to Wayfarer for a plan
Insurance	Sort out insurance cover on a national basis for community schemes to use
Technology	Car clubs supported to move into using versatile new technology and helped to procure good technology
Shared electric cars	Monitor Clim-ATIC pilot programme in Badenoch and Strathspey for acceptability of electric cars and sharing systems
Shared software	Experience of Park Carpool (Moray) in using tested accounts software may be possible to syndicate more widely like open source software

Support programme

Scottish Government support: climate policy	Support for Low Carbon vehicles to include car clubs as part of promoting climate strategy
Funding 1	Include in Council's Single Outcome Agreements targets
Funding 2	Support increase sustainable transport modes
Funding mechanism 1	Ring-fencing of Scottish Government funding - need to target money to achieve objectives
Funding mechanism 2	Ring fence within Sustainable Transport budgets
Improve air quality	Air Quality branch support - grants for Low Emission Zones to support expansion of car clubs
Community support	Package of advice, resources for community groups - gatekeeper role
National policy	Guidance on National Performance Indicators
Promotion	Promote car clubs in local policy - where's the framework
Shared cars	Pooling by employers and with communities. Supported by SNH involving volunteers, businesses and partners.
Low carbon cars 1	Encourage sales through car clubs
Low carbon cars 2	Variety of models offered

4 Workshop 3 Perth 08.11.09

Opportunities

Land use planning	Town planning needs to give more consideration to transport hubs. Needs regulation to ensure transport operators to work together to be successful.
Integration with public transport	Public transport hubs promote integration by bringing together all transport modes/choices (inc. car clubs)
Hubs	Need to reorganise public transport as interchange based rather than route based with hubs and multi-modal transport options
Funding hubs	Financial support for these hubs from private operators
Multi-modal ticketing	Integration between public transport operators and car club schemes needs multi-modal ticketing
Smart cards	Integrated transport hubs and multi-modal smart cards to pay for it including a salary sacrifice option
Island scheme	Establish link up between Cal Mac and car clubs for islands tourists. To provide on island mobility, encourage travel by public transport to ferry; pick up car on island. Need to set up national liaison scheme for this to work.
Social marketing 1	Image of car clubs needs to be boosted by positioning as part of public transport.
Social marketing 2	Car manufacturer glamorise ownership of car - need to see social marketing of "social responsibility" from government.
Promotion	Promote car club services through Transport Direct and Traveline
Targeting	Car clubs suit those who are considering owning 2 cars - especially in rural communities to avoid second car is a large cost saving
Carbon rationing	Possible carbon rationing to promote uptake of car clubs as part of low carbon strategy. Favour fossil fuel-free cars.
Monitor employers	Monitor car clubs carbon reduction contribution to employers targets
Type of car	Show how low carbon but attractive vehicles are available e.g. Fiat 500 or Mini

Support programme

Funding car club development	Funding for start ups and for expansion. Based on a national solution - need for a bold approach possibly through a Car Club Scotland initiative via Transport Scotland
Non-CCF projects	Funding for non-CCF projects to carry out feasibility studies
Social enterprise	Social enterprise funding to start up car clubs - get over funding gap in first few years
Support to communities	Training and awareness raising for CCF Projects needed to encourage more communities to apply for funding from CCF to develop car clubs.
Kit	“Kit of parts” to help communities and CCF Projects set up car clubs
Open source systems	Subsidise the development of open source systems for car clubs incl. telematics
Standard procedures	Standing Operating Procedures – Scottish Government to support programme accessible for all clubs to use (e.g. paperwork, contracts, and systems).
Promote low carbon vehicles	Needs to be part of national, linked programme for maximum impact
Change staff transport	Pool cars funded – organisations to use instead of mileage claims from employees
Community credits	Tax credits to reward businesses who share resources
Speed dating	Link potential partners to encourage pooling of cars - CCF projects, councils, large employers
Local Integration	Car clubs and LA pool cars to form an integrated package
National procurement	National leasing arrangements for car clubs and employers pool cars run as car clubs. Savings and benefits from national leadership.
Public agencies	Encourage joint working of public agencies to facilitate shared vehicle use (+ sharing with community)
Local government	Brokerage of car club fleets - to “fuel” car schemes
Parking	Local authorities need convincing of benefits of car clubs to offer parking spaces for car clubs
Operators 1	Trial of car club (one week or one month); encourage VIPs
Operators 2	Loyalty scheme to encourage users
Operators 3	Encourage car club members to ride share
Operators 4	Link car clubs – Edinburgh, Aberdeen so that members can use cars in each place
Operators 5	Promote car clubs membership to VIPs - free trial membership to MSPs
Travel marketing 1	Integrated with green journey planners (like in TfL)
Travel marketing 2	Travel marketing (1 to 1) available to every individual/family in Scotland to promote options
National advertising 1	Promote other choices of travel by campaign on how much it costs to run a car
National advertising 2	Information about real costs per mile of car use - “it’s greater than you think!” Get the message across

5 Workshop 4 Linlithgow 03.12.09

Barriers

Parking	Reserve bays need to be kept clear
Setting objectives	Low carbon cars - need to be part of declared "mission statement" of public bodies
Low carbon vehicles	Case for car clubs as low carbon operator needs to be clearer

Opportunities

Reduce car use	Stem increasing car usage in towns well served by public transport
Incentives	Create incentives for taking cars off the road
Emission targets	Use Climate Act targets for transport as catalyst
Low carbon operation	Complex issues - use Climate Change act to provide leverage to promote carbon benefit of car clubs
Council staff travel	Establish council staff travel option using pool cars. Car club allows use by local community (e.g. living or working within 800 yards of central parking location)

Support programme

Public Transport integration	Design simpler multi-modal ticket system to include rail bus city car and bike hire
Link to other modes	Encourage link to more incentives - bike hire, car loan for tourists
Simplify options	Simplify public transport offering through integration
Support awareness	Create a recognised national travel brand
Education	Identify car clubs as a "mode" of transport
Target audience	Reach target audience for car clubs through joint programmes led by RTPs
Advertising promotion	Raise awareness in non-urban settings
Small town	Use council as anchor tenant in small town with council offices - assured parking bays
Council involvement	Share pool of car club cars with neighbourhood - residents and employers
Parking enforcement	Improve parking supervision. Decriminalisation not everywhere so cars could get blocked
Parking charges	Increase car parking charges to discourage non car club users

Appendix 4

References

Atkins/University Of Aberdeen	Mitigating Transport's Climate Change Impact in Scotland: Assessment of Policy Options (Scottish Government, 2009). Available at http://openscotland.net/Publications/2009/08/26141950/0
Brown, Jim	Community Investment - using Industrial & Provident Society legislation (Co-operatives UK, October 2008)
Carplus	Low Emission Car Clubs for a Healthier, Equitable and Sustainable Transport Future (2009) http://www.carplus.org.uk/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2009/12/Low-Emission-Car-Clubs-for-a-Healthier-Equitable-and-Sustainable-Transport-Future-Draft4-nov09.pdf
Carplus	Fast Track Guide to Setting up a Car Club http://www.carplus.org.uk/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2009/12/Fast-Track-Guide.pdf
Carplus	Briefing paper for Secretary of State, DfT (November 2009, unpublished)
Clark, Matthew Steer Davies Gleave	Camden & Islington Car Club Market Study (presentation at Carplus Conference, March 2010)
Dept for Transport	Making Car Sharing and Car Clubs Work - A Good Practice Guide (March 2005)
Edinburgh Car Club Conference 2009	Proceedings from the Conference by City of Edinburgh Council and Transform Scotland Trust: Proceedings http://www.ratransport.co.uk/images/Edin%20Proceedings%20190309.pdf Speakers' presentations are available at http://www.ratransport.co.uk/postcarclubconf.html
Hope S (System Three)	Monitoring & Evaluation of Edinburgh City Car Club (Scottish Executive CRU, 2001)
Ledbury, Matthew	Quick Hits 4: Car Clubs (UKERC, Sept 2007)
Myers D & Cairns (Transport Research Laboratory)	Annual Survey of Car Clubs Report (2008/09) http://www.carplus.org.uk/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2009/12/Low-Emission-Car-Clubs-for-a-Healthier-Equitable-and-Sustainable-Transport-Future-Draft4-nov09.pdf
Sustainable Development Commission	Edinburgh City Car Club - Case study www.sd-commission.org.uk/communitiessummit/show_case_study.php/00085.html
Synovate	Attitudes towards Car Clubs. Research for Transport for London (April 2007)
The Countryside Agency	Rural Car Clubs (2004) Interim Report of a pilot programme - CA 172
Zipcar news release	'Zipcar Announces First Comprehensive Global Car-Sharing Study' (3rd June 2009) Available at www.zipcar.com .

Glossary

CCF	Climate Challenge Fund
CPZ	Controlled Parking Zone
EU	European Union
EV	electric vehicle
HIE	Highlands & Islands Enterprise
ICT	information and communication technology
KPI	key performance indicator
LEZ	Low Emission Zone
LCV	low carbon vehicle
MSP	Member of the Scottish Parliament
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NPI	National Performance Indicator
OLEV	Office for Low Emission Vehicles
RTP	Regional Transport Partnership
SOA	Single Outcome Agreement
SME	small and medium-sized enterprise
SNH	Scottish Natural Heritage
TfL	Transport for London
TRO	Traffic Regulation Order
TST	Transform Scotland Trust
ULEV	ultra low emission vehicle

Transform Scotland Trust
5 Rose Street
Edinburgh
EH2 2PR

+44 (0)131 243 2691

e: trust@transformscotland.org.uk

www.transformscotland.org.uk

Charity No. SCO36706

